Security Perceptions of the Michigan Public: Implementing the Western Hemisphere Travel Initiative and the Real ID Act

Overview of Findings

A statewide survey of Michigan residents finds most prefer the use of a driver’s license holding more identifying information over the passport to strengthen U.S. border security, an area designated as a top state priority by survey participants. An “enhanced driver’s license” or EDL would include biometric information such as fingerprints.

The new survey results indicate that most Michigan adult residents understand an enhanced driver’s license (EDL) is a tool that will make it more difficult for terrorists to falsely obtain a Michigan driver’s license or to obtain multiple state driver’s licenses. Such acceptance balances Michigan residents’ concerns between the need for strengthening border security, privacy, and the cost of acceptable travel documents.

The majority of Michigan adult residents state that the use of the current driver’s license to enter or reenter from Canada does not prevent terrorists from entering the United States. Nearly one third strongly agree that the passport does a better job of keeping terrorists from entering the United States through Canada, and more than 40 percent somewhat agree.

While Michigan residents claim that requiring everyone to present a passport when entering or reentering the State from Canada deters terrorists, they are less supportive of relying on passports, likely due to concerns about the cost of a passport. In contrast, there is strong preference for an EDL over the passport for more accurate identification and stronger border security.

Key Findings

Nearly 75 percent of Michigan residents are very (24%) or somewhat (50.4%) confident in the level of security at the Michigan-Canada border.

More than half of Michigan residents (51.9%) strongly agree that preventing terrorists from entering Michigan through Canada should be a top priority.

Michigan residents agree that passports will do a better job than a driver’s license to keep terrorists from entering the U.S. through Canada (29.2% strongly agree and 40.7% somewhat agree).

Michigan residents (68%) favor an enhanced driver’s license with more information (such as fingerprints) on it over a passport.

A clear majority of Michigan residents (87.7%) oppose their Social Security number on an enhanced driver’s license.
Policy Concerns

The majority of Michigan’s population lives within 25 miles of the international border shared with Canada, and an estimated 200 million people cross between Michigan and Canada per year. These transient and spontaneous crossings, referring to those who cross frequently and those who cross only on occasion, have significant impact on the state’s overall economy.

Considering that the Canada-United States border is an integral part of Michigan’s economic growth, Michigan policy leaders are concerned with the need to enhance border security. As a result, the Michigan Secretary of State, in cooperation with the Department for Homeland Security, has proposed an enhanced driver’s license, allowing citizens to hold one document that complies with both the REAL ID Act and the WHTI. There is also consideration of driver’s licenses with varying levels of compliance with the federal requirements. For example, some people have no intention of crossing an international border, but wish to have access to federal buildings. A “limited” enhanced driver’s license would meet new federal requirements.

Perceptions of Security at the Border

As a vital part of the state’s economy, the Michigan-Canadian border is traveled daily by thousands of business people, truck drivers, tourists, and regular commuters. For years, Michigan citizens more freely crossed the international border primarily for entertainment. Prior to February 2008, the security system at the border required Michigan residents to only show either a driver’s license or a birth certificate when they re-entered Michigan from Canada. Now, a passport is considered an acceptable document for crossing the border.

When asked about confidence in the security at the Michigan-Canadian border, three out of four residents say they are “very or somewhat” confident. While this confidence is relatively high, it does not override one’s concern for safety. When asked about concern regarding border security, nearly three of five Michigan residents (59%) say they are “very concerned” or “somewhat concerned” about security at the Michigan-Canadian border.

Response to WHTI

The majority of Michigan residents say the prevention of known terrorists from entering Michigan from Canada is a priority issue for state and federal officials. The majority also perceive the passport, rather than the current driver’s license, as a more secure and reliable document that will enable the state to prevent known terrorists from entering Michigan from Canada.

Four out of five Michigan residents (80%) say they strongly or somewhat agree that preventing terrorists from entering Michigan from Canada should be a top priority. Roughly 20% of Michigan residents say they somewhat or strongly disagree that such prevention measures should be a top priority.

Note on Survey Design

This report summarizes data collected in a telephone survey of 1,001 randomly selected Michigan adult residents between Oct 10 and Nov 26, 2007. Conducted by IPPSR’s Office for Survey Research at Michigan State University, this survey was part of the larger State of the State Survey (SOSS). Details of the methodology are posted at www.ippsr.msu.edu/SOSS/SOSS.HTM. The margin of error is +/-3% at a 95% confidence interval. Percentages have been rounded upward at the .5 mark throughout this report, thus many totals presented in the text will not equal 100%. Support from the Michigan Applied Public Policy Research Grant Program helped to fund the survey.
Response to REAL ID

Given concerns about balancing security, privacy, and efficient cross-border travel, the results of the survey are quite striking. A significant majority of Michigan residents are willing to have fingerprints included on an enhanced driver’s license, and to share this biometric information, together with photographs, with federal and state agencies. An overwhelming majority of Michigan residents (88%) oppose the inclusion of their Social Security number on an enhanced driver’s license. On balance, Michigan citizens are willing to permit the use of some personal information to be included and exchanged between federal and state agencies for the purpose of further securing the state’s international border.

Fingerprint Information

When asked whether they favor or oppose having fingerprint information included on an enhanced driver’s license, more than two-thirds of Michigan residents favor the fingerprint information.

Biometric Information

The majority of Michigan residents not only favor the inclusion of fingerprint information on an EDL, but also favor the state sharing information about anyone crossing the border with federal and state agencies. In fact, 78% of the respondents say they favor this policy.

Social Security Numbers

Nearly nine of ten residents oppose having this identification number included on border crossing documents. Only 12% say they favor having this information included on an enhanced driver’s license. This may reflect a healthy citizen awareness of identity theft through access to Social Security numbers.

The majority of Michigan residents (31% strongly disagreeing and 22% somewhat disagreeing) do not believe that a driver’s license is sufficient identification for keeping terrorists from entering Michigan from Canada.

Seventy percent of Michigan residents say they somewhat agree or strongly agree that requiring individuals to present a passport will do a better job of keeping terrorists from entering the United States through Canada. Of the remaining 30%, about half say they “somewhat disagree” that requiring passports instead of the current driver’s license will do a better job of keeping terrorists from entering the U. S. through Canada. Thirteen percent “strongly disagree.”

Key Authors of the Brief

Gen. Michael C. McDaniel, J.D., M.S.S., M.A., Governor’s Advisor on Homeland Security and Assistant Adjutant General for Homeland Security, Department of Military and Veterans Affairs


Edmund F. McGarrell, Ph.D., Professor and Director of the School of Criminal Justice, Michigan State University

AnnMarie Schneider, M.S., Director for IPPSR Program Planning and MSU’s Legislative Leadership Program

This brief is available online at www.ippsr.msu.edu.
Balancing Personal Interest with Border Security

To secure the border and make it tougher for terrorists to enter, under the REAL ID, new requirements call for national uniform standards for driver’s licenses and ID cards, including specified data and security features. Instead of using a passport, more than two-thirds of Michigan residents (68%) favor using an enhanced license. When asked whether they are likely to apply for an EDL, the majority (58%) are “somewhat or very likely” to apply.

Clearly, there is also a point at which Michiganders will not surrender specific personal identifying information. While a strong majority accepts the need to provide, and for the state to share biometric data, an even stronger majority would not accept the government’s use of their Social Security numbers as personal identifiers at border crossings. Thus, further surveys should explore the balance of enhancing border security and public safety against further use of personal identifying information.

Further Study Needs

Although the study has shown that the majority of the State’s citizens prefer an enhanced driver’s license over a passport to cross the international border between Michigan and Canada, the acceptance of REAL ID is not yet known. As such, a follow-up survey to learn more about the attitude and perception of Michigan residents on this matter is planned. Further study of the frequency and reason for travel across the Michigan-Canada border is of interest to this research team and policy leaders.

For More Information

About this study and the results, contact:
BG Michael C. McDaniel, State of Michigan Homeland Security Advisor, mcdanielm@michigan.gov or (517) 483-5833.

Edmund McGarrell, Director and Professor, School of Criminal Justice, mcgarrel@msu.edu or (517) 355-2192.

About the brief or MSU’s Institute for Public Policy and Social Research, contact:
Douglas B. Roberts, IPPSR Director, (517) 355-6672, or AnnMarie Schneider, annmarie@msu.edu, (517) 355-6672.

About the State of the State Survey, contact:
Charles Ballard, State of the State Survey Director, ballard@msu.edu, (517) 355-6672.